

Biorenewable Insights

Carbon Dioxide to Chemicals and Fuels

Table of Contents

A Report by NexantThinking™

Published October 2017

www.nexantthinking.com

Section	Page
1 Executive Summary	1
1.1 OVERVIEW	1
1.2 TECHNOLOGIES	3
1.3 ECONOMICS	4
1.3.1 USGC	7
1.3.2 South America.....	8
1.3.3 Western Europe	9
1.3.4 Asia.....	10
1.4 CARBON DIOXIDE UTILIZATION AND END OF LIFE	12
1.4.1 Overview	12
1.4.2 Global Analysis.....	12
2 Introduction.....	18
2.1 SEGMENTATION OF SOURCES.....	19
2.2 DISPOSITION OF CARBON DIOXIDE	19
2.3 PRODUCTS FROM CARBON DIOXIDE	20
2.3.1 Existing Uses.....	21
3 Technologies	24
3.1 ORGANIC CARBONATES.....	24
3.1.1 Ethylene Carbonate.....	24
3.1.2 Dimethyl Carbonate.....	27
3.1.3 Polycarbonates.....	30

3.1.4	Key Players	39
3.2	DRY REFORMING AND SYNGAS	40
3.2.1	Key Players	47
3.3	UREA.....	47
3.3.1	Key Players	50
3.4	METHANOL	53
3.4.1	Key Players	59
3.5	SODA ASH.....	61
3.6	BIOTECHNOLOGY FEEDSTOCK.....	64
3.6.1	Succinic Acid	65
3.6.2	Algae Technology.....	90
3.6.3	Syngas Fermentations	140
3.7	ELECTROCHEMICAL CONVERSION OF CO ₂	154
3.7.1	Formic Acid	154
3.7.2	DMC	159
3.7.3	Liquid Light/Avantium	160
3.7.4	Others.....	162
3.8	CEMENT	163
3.8.1	Calera.....	163
3.8.2	Carbon Sense Solutions	167
3.8.3	Novacem	168
3.8.4	Other Minor Players	168
3.8.5	Key Players	169
3.9	OTHER USES	169
3.9.1	Salicylic Acid	169
3.9.2	CO ₂ as a Solvent	171
3.9.3	Other.....	172
4	Economics.....	174
4.1	METHODOLOGY	174
4.1.1	Operating Cost Elements	174
4.2	PRICES	176
4.3	COMPARISON OF CAPEX.....	177
4.4	COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS BY REGION	177
4.4.1	USGC	179
4.4.2	South America.....	184

4.4.3	Western Europe	189
4.4.4	Asia.....	193
4.5	COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS BY PROCESS.....	197
5	CO ₂ Utilization and End of Life.....	203
5.1	OVERVIEW	203
5.2	GLOBAL ANALYSIS	203
5.2.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	203
5.2.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential	206
5.3	NORTH AMERICAN ANALYSIS.....	209
5.3.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	209
5.3.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential	210
5.4	SOUTH AMERICAN ANALYSIS.....	211
5.4.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	211
5.4.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential	212
5.5	WESTERN EUROPE ANALYSIS	213
5.5.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	213
5.5.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential	214
5.6	ASIA ANALYSIS.....	215
5.6.1	CO ₂ Utilization Potential	215
5.6.2	CO ₂ End of Life Potential	216
6	References	218

Figure	Page
1.1 Carbon Stabilization Wedges	2
1.2 USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency	8
1.3 Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency.....	9
1.4 Western Europe Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and showing Capital Efficiency	10
1.5 China Carbon Dioxide Consumption versus Return and showing Capital Efficiency	11
1.6 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, Composite Model	13
1.7 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model	13
1.8 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model.....	14
1.9 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, World Leader Model	14
1.10 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model.....	15
1.11 World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, Composite Model.....	15
1.12 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model	16
1.13 World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model.....	16
1.14 World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, World Leader Model	17
1.15 World CO ₂ End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model.....	17
2.1 Carbon Stabilization Wedges	18
3.1 Ethylene Carbonate Production	26
3.2 Asahi Kasei Ethylene Carbonate Transesterification with Methanol.....	28
3.3 Asahi Kasei/Chi Mei Melt Polycarbonate Process	33
3.4 Conventional Steam Methane Reforming	43
3.5 Block Flow Diagram for Combined CO ₂ and Steam Methane Reforming.....	44
3.6 Sandia's CR5	46
3.7 Urea Yield as a Function of NH ₃ /CO ₂ Ratio	49
3.8 Conversion of Carbon Dioxide to Urea at Different Temperatures	50
3.9 Snamprogetti Ammonia Stripping Process for Urea	52
3.10 Bench Scale 50 kg per day Methanol Synthesis Plant	55
3.11 Electrolytic Methanol Synthesis.....	58
3.12 Solvay Process Block Flow Diagram	62
3.13 Refined Sodium Bicarbonate Process Flow Diagram	63
3.14 Cell Metabolic Carbon Balance	64

3.15 Major Metabolic Pathways in a Typical Cell.....	67
3.16 Central Glucose Metabolic Pathway in a Typical Cell.....	68
3.17 Anaerobic Degradation of Pyruvate	70
3.18 Glyoxylate and TCA Cycles.....	71
3.19 Oxidative and Reductive TCA Branches	72
3.20 Calculations for Maximum Anaerobic Theoretical Yield from Glucose	74
3.21 Calculations for Maximum Theoretical Combined Pathway Yield from Glucose	75
3.22 Calculations for Maximum Oxidative and Reductive Theoretical Yield from Glucose	76
3.23 BioAmber Plant in Sarnia, Canada	78
3.24 BioAmber Fermentation Process Flow Diagram	82
3.25 BioAmber Succinic Acid Purification Flow Diagram	83
3.26 Succinity Semi-commercial Plant in Montmelo, Spain	84
3.27 Succinity’s Assumed Pathways to Biosuccinic Acid	85
3.28 Succinity Fermentation Simple Flow Diagram	88
3.29 Succinity Purification Simple Flow Diagram.....	89
3.30 Photosynthesis in Algae	96
3.31 PAR Wavelengths	97
3.32 Photosynthetic Efficiency of Algae	98
3.33 Light Penetration in Water of the Absorbable Spectrum.....	99
3.34 Optical Density Photo-Inhibition	99
3.35 Metabolic Pathways	101
3.36 Micrographs of Algae before (Left) and After (Right) Oil Accumulation.....	101
3.37 Scripps Research Institute’s Proposed Algae System	105
3.38 Raceway Algae Pond Diagram	107
3.39 Raceway Algae Pond.....	107
3.40 Round Pond.....	108
3.41 Some Microalgae Species Currently in Commercial Production	108
3.42 Selected Open Pond Algae Projects Currently in Operation	109
3.43 Some of the Different Types of Closed Systems for Algal Cultivation	110
3.44 Solix’s Closed System for Algae Cultivation	110
3.45 NASA’s “Open-Ocean” Photobioreactors.....	111
3.46 Solazyme/TerraVia’s Lab-Scale Fermenter	112
3.47 Metabolic Pathway Used Heterotrophic Algae Growth Systems	113
3.48 Algae’s Role in Ocean Dead Zones	114
3.49 Algae Removal in China.....	115

3.50	Overlay of Global Stationary Sources of CO ₂ Emissions and Net Surface Solar Radiation	116
3.51	Distribution of Stationary Sources of Carbon Dioxide	119
3.52	Electric Power Plant Location Relative to Average Annual Solar Hours Received	120
3.53	JAXA Analysis of Global CO ₂ Emissions	121
3.54	Algae Oil Production Options	124
3.55	Algae Oil Energy Requirements	124
3.56	Auto-Flocculation of Algae	125
3.57	AlgaeVenture Systems Harvester	126
3.58	Algae Dried Using AlgaeVenture Systems Harvester	127
3.59	Lysis in Algae	128
3.60	Diagram of an Oil Expeller	129
3.61	Algae Oil Separation via Ultrasonics	129
3.62	Origin Oil's Extraction Process	130
3.63	Sponge-Like Nanoparticles for Algal Oil Extraction	130
3.64	Tilapia	132
3.65	Brine Shrimp and Algae	132
3.66	Sapphire Energy's Process Overview	136
3.67	Reductive Acetyl-CoA Pathway	142
3.68	300-Ton Pre-commercial Plant at Baosteel Mill near Shanghai	144
3.69	LanzaTech's Product Platform	145
3.70	Indian River County Bioenergy Center	148
3.71	Kiverdi Reactor Design	152
3.72	Two Possible Kiverdi Reactor Process Configurations	153
3.73	Representative Schematic of ECFORM Reactor	156
3.74	Mantra ERC System	157
3.75	Representation of a Flow through Photocatalyst Array	159
3.76	Block Flow Diagram for Liquid Light's CO ₂ to Chemicals – Electrochemical Cell	161
3.77	Block Flow Diagram for Liquid Light's CO ₂ to Chemicals – Second Reactor	161
3.78	Calera "Cement" Production Pilot Plant	164
3.79	Solubility of Carbon Dioxide in Water at Different Pressures/Temperatures	165
3.80	CO ₂ Speciation and Solubility at 25 °C and P(CO ₂) 0.1 MPa with a Total Carbon(IV) Activity = 1	166
3.81	Simplified Salicylic Acid Production by Kolbe-Schmitt Method	170
3.82	Pressure –Temperature Diagram of Carbon Dioxide Illustrating the Critical Point	172
3.83	Ammonium Sulfate and Calcium Carbonate Production Process Flow Diagram	173

4.1	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels USGC Economic Competitiveness	179
4.2	USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency	181
4.3	USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency, Excluding Liquid Light and Cement.....	182
4.4	USGC Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency for Technologies with Positive Returns	182
4.5	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Brazil Economic Competitiveness	184
4.6	Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency.....	186
4.7	Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency, Excluding Liquid Light and Cement.....	187
4.8	Brazil Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency for Technologies with Positive Returns	187
4.9	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Western Europe Economic Competitiveness	189
4.10	Western Europe Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency ..	191
4.11	Western Europe	191
4.12	Western Europe	192
4.13	CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels China Economic Competitiveness	193
4.14	China Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency	195
4.15	China Carbon Dioxide Consumption vs Return and showing Capital Efficiency for Technologies with Positive Returns	195
4.16	Urea via Biogas Comparative Economics by Region	198
4.17	Methanol via Biogas Comparative Economics by Region	198
4.18	Succinic Acid Comparative Economics by Region.....	199
4.19	Open Pond Algae Oil Comparative Economics by Region	199
4.20	PBR Algae Oil Comparative Economics by Region.....	199
4.21	Heterotrophic Algae Oil Comparative Economics by Region.....	200
4.22	Syngas Fermentation to Ethanol Comparative Economics by Region	200
4.23	Liquid Light MEG Comparative Economics by Region	200
4.24	Corn Ethanol Comparative Economics by Region	201
4.25	Sugarcane Ethanol Comparative Economics by Region	201
4.26	Ethanol to MEG Comparative Economics by Region	201
4.27	Ethylene Carbonate Comparative Economics by Region	202
4.28	Cement Comparative Economics by Region	202
5.1	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, Composite Model	204
5.2	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model	204
5.3	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model.....	205
5.4	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential, World Leader Model	205

5.5	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model.....	206
5.6	World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, Composite Model.....	207
5.7	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less, Composite Model	207
5.8	World CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits US\$0 to US\$100, Composite Model.....	208
5.9	World CO ₂ End of Life Potential, World Leader Model	208
5.10	World CO ₂ End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits less than US\$100, World Leader Model.....	209
5.11	North America CO ₂ Utilization Potential	209
5.12	North America CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100	210
5.13	North America CO ₂ End of Life Potential	210
5.14	North American End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less.....	211
5.15	South America CO ₂ Utilization Potential	211
5.16	South America CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100.....	212
5.17	South America CO ₂ End of Life Potential.....	212
5.18	South American End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less	213
5.19	Western Europe CO ₂ Utilization Potential	213
5.20	Western Europe CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100	214
5.21	Western Europe CO ₂ End of Life Potential	214
5.22	Western Europe End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less.....	215
5.23	Asia CO ₂ Utilization Potential	215
5.24	Asian CO ₂ Utilization Potential for Carbon Credits Less than US\$100.....	216
5.25	Asian CO ₂ End of Life Potential	216
5.26	Asian End of Life Potential for Carbon Credits at US\$100 or less.....	217

Table	Page
1.1 Current Developers of Carbon Dioxide to Chemicals Technologies	3
1.2 USGC Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	7
1.3 Brazil Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	9
1.4 Western Europe Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	10
1.5 China Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	11
2.1 Non-Transformative Uses of Carbon Dioxide	19
2.2 Current Developers of Carbon Dioxide to Chemicals Technologies	20
3.1 Typical Characteristic Syngas Composition	41
3.2 Glycolysis and TCA Cycle: Successive Enzymatic Reactions	69
3.3 Ethanol and Lactic Fermentation Reactions.....	70
3.4 Glyoxylate Cycle Reactions.....	71
3.5 Highest Yields Reported for the Selected Microorganisms.....	77
3.6 Algae Industry Status of Development.....	92
3.7 Algae Industry Supporters Status of Development	94
3.8 Composition of Selected Microalgae.....	103
3.9 Oil Yield and Oil Content of Various Biomass Feedstocks	117
3.10 Profile of Global Stationary CO ₂ Sources (< 0.1 TPA CO ₂)	118
3.11 Profile of U.S. CO ₂ Emissions from Stationary Sources	119
3.12 Cell Densities of Heterotrophic Algae for PUFAs (<u>P</u> o <u>l</u> y <u>u</u> n <u>s</u> at <u>u</u> r <u>a</u> t <u>e</u> d <u>F</u> at <u>t</u> y <u>A</u> c <u>i</u> d <u>s</u>)	125
3.13 Algae Harvesting Options.....	126
3.14 Common Algae Drying Schemes	127
3.15 Biochemical Carbon Fixation Pathways.....	141
3.16 Theoretical Yields of Ethanol Production Using Reductive Acetyl-CoA Pathway.....	143
3.17 Non-Transformative Uses of Carbon Dioxide	173
4.1 Prices for Main Feedstock, Byproduct, and Utilities Inputs to Models	176
4.2 CAPEX Comparison Table.....	177
4.3 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels USGC Economic Competitiveness	180
4.4 USGC Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	180
4.5 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Brazil Economic Competitiveness	185
4.6 Brazil Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE).....	185
4.7 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels Western Europe Economic Competitiveness	190
4.8 Western Europe Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	190
4.9 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Fuels China Economic Competitiveness	194
4.10 China Returns on Capital Employed (ROCE)	194

NexantThinking™

Biorenewable Insights



Nexant, Inc. (www.nexant.com) is a leading management consultancy to the global energy, chemical, and related industries. For over 38 years, Nexant has helped clients increase business value through assistance in all aspects of business strategy, including business intelligence, project feasibility and implementation, operational improvement, portfolio planning, and growth through M&A activities. Nexant has its main offices in San Francisco (California), White Plains (New York), and London (UK), and satellite offices worldwide.

Contact Details:

New York: Steven Slome

Phone: + 1-914-609-0379, e-mail: sslome@nexant.com

London: Sonia Ouertani, Client Services Coordinator, E&CA-Products

Phone: + 44 (0) 20 7950-1587, e-mail: souertani@nexant.com

Nexant, Inc. (www.nexant.com) is a leading management consultancy to the global energy, chemical, and related industries. For over 38 years, Nexant has helped clients increase business value through assistance in all aspects of business strategy, including business intelligence, project feasibility and implementation, operational improvement, portfolio planning, and growth through M&A activities. Nexant has its main offices in San Francisco (California), White Plains (New York), and London (UK), and satellite offices worldwide.

Copyright © by Nexant Inc. 2017. All Rights Reserved.